

My partner and I must negate today's resolution. **Resolved:** *That the United States government should implement universal health care modeled after the French system.*

**Contention 1: The French system of universal health care is incompatible with the United States of America and its values.** The Fifth Republic of France has a population of 60 million people (2), all of whom are covered by a government-implemented health care program. Every family in France earning more than 50 thousand Euros a year jointly pays a 45% (6) income tax to support their universal health care program. France has a land area less than that of the State of Texas. Furthermore, French presidents have the power to freely dissolve their National Assembly at any time. Also, French medical schools are free of tuition. All of these small facts portray a BIG message: Any French system of health care would never work for the United States. No U.S. system should ever be modeled after something that only works for 60 million people when there are 300 million American citizens. It would be irresponsible to implement a system in our country that has only been practiced in a land area less than that of one our FIFTY states. It would be unequal and unfair to raise the burden on the American tax-payer from the current 15% to 45%. Additionally, in the Democratic-Republic of the United States of America, it is not just to raise the burden upon 100% of citizens to insure the coverage of the 15 % uninsured citizens. America should not model their health care system after a country that does not share the same core principles, population, land area, and government style.

**Contention 2: Universal health care modeled after the French system is economically infeasible in the United States.** America is at the epicenter of a global financial crisis. Wall Street is down thousands of points, and government spending is out of control. According to the official government budget (1) for the 2009 fiscal year, another 407 billion dollars will be added to the national debt of 10.2 trillion dollars. It is clear that the American government is already

spending too much money and therefore cannot afford to take on even more spending. In fact, according to Business Week, France cannot even afford its own system, quote: “France is wrestling with runaway health-care inflation.” But not only can the government of the United States not afford to implement universal health care modeled after the French, neither can the American people. American citizens should retain the right and responsibility to choose their own health coverage -- individuals make the best decisions with their money and about their well-being, not Washington bureaucrats. Americans should not have to increase their tax burdens to cover the health care of only 15% of the population. On top of this, according to Business Week, doctors are paid far less by the French System than in America because of the fact that French medical school is free. However, the U.S. does not have a free medical school system in place; therefore the French system in America would result in a decrease in doctor pay, adding to the already extensive burden of tuition bills. It is evident that the United States cannot afford the cost in dollars or the loss of individual fiscal control that comes with the French system of universal health care.

**Contention 3: French universal health care in America would sacrifice quality in exchange for quantity.** A doctor shortage is the first of a long list of problems that come with universal health care. According to USA TODAY, there will be a shortage of 85 to 200 thousand doctors by the year 2020. With the baby-boomer generation hitting retirement and needing even more medical attention, instigating universal health care would only augment the already serious shortage of medical professionals. In addition, the waiting times seen in other universal health care countries would only be worse in America because of the sheer distance in miles between sparsely distributed doctors and the 46 million more people flooding our nation’s hospitals. Even more crippling to our nation would be the massively increased number of illegal immigrants

inside our country's borders. If the United States offered free health care, foreign citizens would only be even more motivated to break our laws and enter the country illegally. Universal health care will severely reduce the quality come to be expected in the United States.

20<sup>th</sup> Century journalist Henry Mencken said it best: "For every problem, there is a solution that is simple, elegant, and **wrong**." This is exactly what universal health care seems to be. It is easy, simple, and elegant to try and do anything to give health care to as many people as possible, but it is crucial to examine the true costs of doing just that. Because America cannot afford the financial cost, the decrease in individual democratic rights, or the sacrifice of quality that accompanies the French system of universal health care, I must urge a **CON** ballot in today's debate. Thank you.

#### Sources

1. <http://www.gpoaccess.gov/usbudget/browse.html> (Government Access Website)
2. <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/> (CIA World Fact Book)
3. [http://www.usatoday.com/news/health/2005-03-02-doctor-shortage\\_x.htm](http://www.usatoday.com/news/health/2005-03-02-doctor-shortage_x.htm) (USA Today)
4. Buying a Property in France: An Insider Guide to Realizing Your Dream (Clive Kristen)
5. Délégation à l'Aménagement du Territoire et à l'Action Régionale (DATAR)
6. [http://www.businessweek.com/magazine/content/07\\_28/b4042070.htm](http://www.businessweek.com/magazine/content/07_28/b4042070.htm) (Bus. Week 7/07)

